

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday February 1, 2021



2:00 PM Regular Meeting:

Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Acting Chair-Commissioner Donna Bosold, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Kate Deloach, and Commissioner Brian Shea. Commissioner Alice Allen was present for a portion of the meeting.

Staff present:

Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Devin Tolpin, Senior Planner
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of the Minutes from the meeting on December 7th, 2020.

Brian Shea motioned to approve the minutes from the meeting on December 7th, 2020. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

1. BARRY ROLAND HOFFMAN (File #2020-207) is seeking approval to replace the existing one-story flat roof with a two-story gable V-crimp roof and dormers at 187 Atlantic Circle Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida, having 1 Parcel Identification Number 00556300-000000 and legally described as the East 20 Feet of Lot 12 and West 30 Feet of Lot 13, Block E, TAVERNIER 2, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2-8, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Opening discussion

Donna Bosold began by asking Peter Morris how this item is in front of us when we do not know whether to view it as contributing or non-contributing. 187 Atlantic Circle Drive is considered historic since it was one of the structures newly recorded in the 2016 Historic Structure Survey. Was this survey adopted by the BOCC? There seems to be a disconnect. This project will be a dramatic alteration.

Peter Morris said the question is, was there a resolution accepting the report.

Ms. Bosold said without this question answered we are in an awkward position. asked why isn't this included in the LDR's?

Devin Tolpin explained that any property owner can make an application like this. Then it is up to the HPC to make a determination.

Mr. Morris said a resolution is of a temporary nature.

Kate Deloach stated, even without a designation because of its location in the historic district, it still comes before us.

Ms. Bosold said why do we do a survey and not follow through after spending time and money. This does not serve the public.

Mr. Morris said this is not a decision made by the County Attorney's Office.

Ms. Bosold said we are charged with protecting this neighborhood.

Mr. Hoffman said the building will be done in a Victorian style.

Brian Shea asked Ms. Tolpin about the project cost.

Ms. Tolpin said that information has not been submitted.

Mr. Shea cautioned Mr. Hoffman will have to look at the project cost as it will be important with regard to the 50/50 rule for improvements.

Ms. Bosold asked the other Commissioners if they should defer this item until we can review the resolution from the BOCC to see what the intent is.

Bert Bender joined the meeting.

Mr. Morris was able to bring up the agenda item which had been submitted from the Finance Department and did not deal with adopting the report content. There was no resolution.

Ms. Bosold explained we have to review this as a non-contributing structure. She asked Ms. Silvia to read the staff report.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Applicant presentation

Mr. Hoffman, property owner, was there to represent the project. He noted that as a resident for 30 years he enjoys the quaint and quiet neighborhood. They need more room. His home has never been classified as historic.

Board Discussion

Ms. Deloach said this is such a dramatic change to the building and is not sure this will accomplish what he wants.

Bert Bender asked if there are floor plans and what the additional space would be used for.

Mr. Hoffman said it would be a bedroom and closet as they need more space because his girlfriend has a six year old son. The existing house is small with one bedroom and an office.

Mr. Bender said he wants to see floor plans for the first and second floors. He cannot judge this project for appropriateness without seeing these plans.

Ms. Bosold asked Ms. Tolpin if floor plans were required.

Ms. Tolpin said floor plans are not listed as a requirement on the application.

Mr. Hoffman asked, when is the next meeting?

Mr. Morris said March 1st.

Mr. Hoffman asked if he was required to attend as he is having eye surgery that day.

Mr. Morris said we can continue to a date certain so you can avoid additional charges.

Ms. Deloach pointed out that we may want to request that floor plans be added as a requirement on the application.

Mr. Shea noted for clarification, that he can get a building permit based on our approval, but if there are changes it will have to come back to us.

Ms. Bosold pointed out the portions of the drawings we have contain very little in the way of dimensions.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to defer this item to the March 1st, 2021 meeting so that floor plans for the first and second floor can be provided and that dimensions are added to the elevation drawings. Brian Shea seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. ROGET BRYAN (File #2020-213) is seeking approval to remove the existing concrete tile roof and replace it with 5 V-crimp roofing at 231 Tarpon Street, within the Tavernier Historic

District, Monroe County, Florida, having Parcel Identification Number 00506680-000000 and legally described as Lots 16 and 17, Singletons Addition to Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 1-15, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Lori Sollito, Keys Roofing, Inc., represented the project and explained they were only replacing the tile roofing with v-crimp roofing.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

There was no board discussion.

Motion

Brian Shea motioned to approve the project as planned. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

3. VALERIE BELL (File #2020-172) is seeking approval to construct an 890 square foot air-conditioned accessory structure (studio space) at 157 Lowe Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida, having Parcel Identification Number 00090270-000200 and described as a parcel of land in Tavernier. Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being hereinafter referred to as Parcel B 10, said parcel being a portion of Lot 10 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD." (Previously reviewed at the HPC meeting on December 7th, 2020)

Applicant presentation of revised plans

Krissy Bohnstedt, agent for the owner, and Red, husband of the owner Valerie Bell, represented the project.

Ms. Bohnstedt explained they have added a porch on the front and reduced the size based on Devin Tolpin's advice.

Red explained this is going to be a pool house with a bedroom and closet.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said the number of bays on the porch should be an odd number.

Donna Bosold asked Ms. Bohnstedt to clarify which elevation faces the street.

Mr. Bender said the porch should have three bays, in which case the double window shown will be in conflict. If the columns are changed a single window would be better suited. An alternative would be to remove the central column to create a single bay porch which would be an odd number.

Motion

Brian Shea motioned to approve the project with the condition that the two bay front porch be changed to a single bay by removing the central column. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Other Business

Diane Silvia said we should address the staff approval matrix again and the addition of the newly recoded structures as contributing to the District. We should try to proceed with these.

Mr. Morris said the matrix was not dropped. It was stopped by the DRC. Now it would be up to the Planning Director if she wants this to go further.

Ms. Deloach said we voted on this. Can't we ask for it to go to the BOCC or is it up to another department to decide that.

Mr. Morris said there is a process for changes to the Land Development Code. It goes first to the DRC and then the Planning Commission. The Planning Director has not elected to send it forward to the Planning Commission.

Ms. Deloach said we would very much like to know where this is in the process. This is especially important now with the virus, when so much has to be done virtually.

Ms. Tolpin said she will discuss this with the Planning Director.

Ms. Bosold asked, can we re-submit this request with reference to what Ms. Deloach has noted, that conditions have changed, and we do not know how long this is going to last. She was very disappointed that we were not notified about the DRC meeting. We need support.

Mr. Shea, as a Planning Director himself, understands the politics involved in making these kinds of changes.

Ms. Bosold said we also need to move forward with adopting the Cultural Resources Survey. What is a reasonable time for staff to respond?

Ms. Tolpin said she has made note of these requests and will hopefully have feedback by April.

Adjournment

Brian Shea motioned to adjourn. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.